The Rhetoric of Responsibility in Party Manifestos (1980-2021)

Supplementary Material

Ceron A, Scopelliti A. The rhetoric of responsibility in party manifestos (1980–2021). *European Journal of Political Research*. Published online 2026:1-22. doi:10.1017/S1475676526101674

Descriptive Statistics

Social Harmony (606): Definition MARPOR/CMP

Robustness Checks

Seed-Dictionaries

OpenAI Prompt

Descriptive Statistics

Table A1. Descriptive statistics for the variables used in the main text.

VARIABLES	Mean	Std. deviation	Min.	Max.
Responsibility Rhetoric (SLDA)	0.779	1.479	0	20
Responsibility Rhetoric (AI)	0.638	1.508	0	40
Moderation	0.108	12.800	-53.656	46.261
Directional Moderation	4.186	15.385	-53.656	73.456
Moderation (WCOG)	2.025	12.870	-49.169	62.309
Directional Moderation (WCOG)	6.169	14.702	-37.919	73.456
Populist	0.157	0.364	0	1
Nicheness	0.456	0.195	0.056	2
Incumbent	0.296	0.457	0	1
Party Size	16.171	14.075	0	69.693
Left-Right	-5.926	20.633	-66.428	72.5
Clarity	0.885	0.106	0.43	1
Issue Diversity	18.106	4.973	1.991	29.819
Technocratic Caretaker	0.039	0.194	0	1
GDP Growth	2.119	3.597	-22.9	12.825
Incumbency Status	0.434	0.725	0	2

Social Harmony (606): Definition MARPOR/CMP

Here we report the exact wording of the Category 606 in the MARPOR/CMP coding schemes, tracking its evolution over time. The changes are highlighted in ***italic***.

CMP TRADITIONAL VERSION (Klingemann et. al., 2006)

606 Social Harmony: Positive

Appeal for national effort and solidarity; need for society to see itself as united; appeal for public spiritedness; decrying anti-social attitudes in times of crisis; support for the public interest.

MARPOR (Coding Scheme V4)

606 ***Civic Mindedness***: Positive

Appeals for national solidarity and the need for society to see itself as united. ***Calls for solidarity with and help for fellow people, familiar and unfamiliar. May include: Favourable mention of the civil society;*** Decrying anti-social attitudes in times of crisis; Appeal for public spiritedness; Support for the public interest.

MARPOR (Coding Scheme V5)

606 Civic Mindedness: Positive ***- comprised of:***

606.1 General

General appeals for national solidarity and the need for society to see itself as united. Calls for solidarity with and help for fellow people, familiar and unfamiliar. May include: Favourable mention of the civil society ***and volunteering***; Decrying anti-social attitudes in times of crisis; Appeal for public spiritedness; Support for the public interest.

606.2 Bottom-Up Activism

Appeals to grassroots movements of social change; banding all sections of society together to overcome common adversity and hardship; appeals to the people as a united actor

Robustness Checks

Table A2. Multilevel linear model of Responsibility Rhetoric. Analysis based on English translation of party manifestos or controlling for populist parties in opposition and extremism of parties on the left-right scale.

VARIABLES	(1) English translation	(2) English translation	(3) Populists in Opposition	(4) Populists in Opposition	(5) Extremism	(6) Extremism
Moderation	0.006†		0.007*		0.010**	
	(0.004)		(0.003)		(0.004)	
Directional Moderation		0.007*		0.006*		0.007*
		(0.003)		(0.003)		(0.003)
Populist	-0.446**	-0.435**	-0.392*	-0.384*	-0.336*	-0.319*
	(0.166)	(0.166)	(0.159)	(0.159)	(0.149)	(0.148)
CMP_nicheness_two	-0.857*	-0.817*	-0.661*	-0.602*	-0.677*	-0.599*
	(0.357)	(0.354)	(0.298)	(0.296)	(0.299)	(0.296)
Incumbent	-0.264	-0.267	-0.247	-0.250†	-0.201	-0.212
	(0.181)	(0.181)	(0.152)	(0.152)	(0.151)	(0.151)
Party Size	0.010†	0.010†	0.007	0.007	0.008	0.008
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)
Incumbent * Party Size	0.014†	0.014†	0.015*	0.015*	0.015*	0.015*
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)
Left-Right	0.001	0.001	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.002
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)
Clarity	0.444	0.453	0.265	0.263	0.180	0.208
	(0.558)	(0.558)	(0.464)	(0.464)	(0.468)	(0.468)
Issue Diversity	-0.038**	-0.035*	-0.027*	-0.023*	-0.026*	-0.022†
	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.012)	(0.011)	(0.012)	(0.012)
Technocratic Caretaker	0.261	0.271	0.005	0.007	0.013	0.010
	(0.351)	(0.351)	(0.265)	(0.265)	(0.266)	(0.266)
GDP Growth	0.010	0.009	0.010	0.009	0.011	0.010
	(0.021)	(0.021)	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)
Extremism					0.005	0.003
					(0.004)	(0.004)
Constant	1.433*	1.318†	1.270*	1.139*	1.221*	1.098†
	(0.684)	(0.682)	(0.567)	(0.566)	(0.570)	(0.572)
Observations	1,389	1,389	1,409	1,409	1,409	1,409
Number of parties	303	303	313	313	313	313
Number of countries	35	35	36	36	36	36
Variance (parties)	0.19	0.19	0.22	0.22	0.22	0.22
Variance (countries)	0.09	0.09	0.07	0.07	0.07	0.07

Standard errors in parentheses. Significance: *** p<0.001, ** p<0.01, * p<0.05, † p<0.1

Table A3. Multilevel linear model of Responsibility Rhetoric, controlling for regions, disproportionality and presidential/semi-presidential systems.

VARIABLES	(1) Regions	(2) Regions	(3) Disproportionality and Presidentialism	(4) Disproportionality and Presidentialism
Moderation	0.007*		0.007*	
	(0.003)		(0.003)	
Directional Moderation		0.006*		0.006*
		(0.003)		(0.003)
Populist	-0.314*	-0.307*	-0.312*	-0.305*
	(0.148)	(0.148)	(0.148)	(0.148)
CMP_nicheness_two	-0.649*	-0.591*	-0.655*	-0.598*
	(0.297)	(0.295)	(0.299)	(0.297)
Incumbent	-0.196	-0.200	-0.218	-0.221
	(0.150)	(0.150)	(0.150)	(0.150)
Party Size	0.008	0.009	0.008	0.008
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)
Incumbent * Party Size	0.014*	0.014*	0.015*	0.015*
	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.006)
Left-Right	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.002
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)
Clarity	0.227	0.224	0.249	0.247
	(0.462)	(0.462)	(0.465)	(0.465)
Issue Diversity	-0.027*	-0.023*	-0.027*	-0.023*
	(0.012)	(0.011)	(0.012)	(0.011)
Technocratic Caretaker	-0.035	-0.035	0.019	0.021
	(0.262)	(0.262)	(0.268)	(0.268)
GDP Growth	0.011	0.010	0.011	0.010
	(0.016)	(0.016)	(0.017)	(0.017)
North America	-0.506	-0.519		
	(0.444)	(0.444)		
Europe	-0.074	-0.086		
	(0.354)	(0.353)		
Africa	1.638*	1.630*		
	(0.639)	(0.639)		
Oceania	-0.321	-0.329		
	(0.461)	(0.461)		
Disproportionality			-0.008	-0.008
			(0.015)	(0.015)
Presidential			-0.060	-0.060
			(0.296)	(0.296)
Semi-Presidential			0.088	0.060
			(0.227)	(0.227)
Constant	1.351*	1.237†	1.293*	1.170*
	(0.676)	(0.675)	(0.573)	(0.572)
Observations	1,409	1,409	1,409	1,409
Number of parties	313	313	313	313
Number of countries	36	36	36	36
Variance (parties)	0.20	0.20	0.22	0.22
Variance (countries)	0.04	0.04	0.07	0.07

Standard errors in parentheses. Significance: *** p<0.001, ** p<0.01, * p<0.05, † p<0.1

Table A4. Multilevel linear model of Responsibility Rhetoric, minimizing missing values.

VARIABLES	(1) SLDA	(2) SLDA	(3) AI	(4) AI
Directional Moderation	0.006*		0.006*	
	(0.002)		(0.003)	
Moderation		0.007*		0.006*
		(0.003)		(0.003)
Populist	-0.249*	-0.251*	-0.240*	-0.244*
	(0.115)	(0.115)	(0.109)	(0.109)
Nicheness	-0.232	-0.259†	-0.356*	-0.379*
	(0.152)	(0.152)	(0.154)	(0.154)
Incumbent	-0.229†	-0.220†	-0.173	-0.161
	(0.121)	(0.120)	(0.123)	(0.123)
Party Size	0.004	0.004	0.004	0.005
	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)	(0.004)
Incumbent * Party Size	0.016**	0.016**	0.012*	0.012*
	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)	(0.005)
Left-Right	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)
Clarity	0.388	0.398	0.385	0.390
	(0.377)	(0.377)	(0.386)	(0.387)
Issue Diversity	-0.014	-0.016†	-0.018*	-0.020*
	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)	(0.009)
Technocratic Caretaker	0.433*	0.434*	0.546**	0.545**
	(0.189)	(0.189)	(0.195)	(0.195)
Crisis References	-0.007	-0.008	-0.009	-0.009
	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)
GDP Growth	-0.011	-0.010	-0.027**	-0.025*
	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)
Unemployment	0.020†	0.020*	0.025*	0.025*
	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)	(0.010)
Constant	0.570	0.617	0.483	0.525
	(0.424)	(0.424)	(0.432)	(0.432)
Observations	1,886	1,886	1,886	1,886
Number of parties	579	579	579	579
Number of countries	38	38	38	38
Variance (parties)	0.18	0.18	0.10	0.10
Variance (countries)	0.04	0.04	0.03	0.03

Standard errors in parentheses. Significance: *** p<0.001, ** p<0.01, * p<0.05, † p<0.1

Seed-Dictionaries

Table A5. List of seed words used for the Seeded-LDA

Language	Responsibility Rhetoric	Bottom-up activism
Catalan	cohesió_social, crisi, bé_comú	societat_civil, fundacions_entitats, moviments_socials, participació_associativa, participació_ciutadana, interès_social, voluntar*, associacions, participació
Czech	sociální_rovnováze, soudržno*, odpověd*, spoluzodpovědnost	odpovědnost, občanská_společnost*, dobrovoln*
Danish	ansvar*, medansvar, fælles_bedste, samhørigheden, krisen, enheder, enhed	samfund, fællesskab*, frivilli*, fællesskab
Dutch	algemeen_belang, sociale_cohesie, crisis*	gemeenschap, vrijwilligerswerk, actief_burgerschap, verenigingen, vrijwilligersorganisaties, cultuurverenigingen, maatschappelijke_organisaties, sociaal_weefsel
English	common_good,crisis, unity,social_bonds,cohe*, bind_us	unit*, communit*, civil_society, charit*
Estonian	tsiaalne_ühtlustamine, sallivust, ühtse*, kodanikuvastutust, vastutust	abatahtlik*, kodanikuühiskon*, koostöö*, eesti_kodanikuühiskonna, eestkosteorganisatsioonid_vabaühendused, kodanikualgatuste_ühenduste, tugevdame_kodanikualgatuste, kodanikeühenduste, vabaühendustega
Finnish	vastuu*, kansalaisvastuuta, yhteisvastuu, siviilirohkeudella, ihmisten_yhteenkuuluvaisuus	järjestöjen, kansalaisjärjestöjen, yhteisö*, solidaarisuu*, yhdistystoiminnassa, kansalaisyhteiskunnan, osallistumisaktiivisuuden
French	vivre_ensemble,agissant_tous,ambition_française, climat_dépressif,france_renouer,intérêt_général, pays_restaurer,redressement_national,réussite_collective, cohésion_sociale	associati*, société_civile,secteur_associatif, solidar*
German	sozialer_zusammenhalt, soziale_kohäsion, gesellschaftlichen_zusammenhalt, krise*, soziale_einheit, gemeinwohl, gemeinwohlorientiert	gemeinschaft*, solidargemeinschaft, bürgerliches_engagement, freiwillige*, verbände*, lebensqualität, beteiligung*, ehrenamt
Hungarian	nemzet_közös, válság*, ország, nemzet, társadalmi_kohéziót	civil_szervezetek*, civil_szféra, civil_társadalom, önkéntesség, gazdasági
Icelandic	eflum_traust, Þjóðarsátt, sátt, efnahagshrunið, traust, þverpólitískri_samstöðu, sáttahöndin	samfélag, sjálfboðavinnu
Italian	responsabil*, bene_comune, coesione_sociale, crisi, unità_nazionale	azione_collettiva, comunit*, impegno_civile, volontari*, disabilità, servizio_civile, cittadinanza_attiva, qualità_vita, partecipazione, educazione_civica, associa*
Latvian	nacionālās_nesaskaņas, vienota_sabiedrība, cieņu, labāku, izaicinājumus, vienotībā	nevalstiskās_organizācijas, nvo
Lithuanian	tautos_erozijos, kriz*, vienybėje, suvienyti, visuomenės_stabilumas	bendruomen*, nevyriausybinių_organizacij*, pilietinė_visuomenė*, socialinių_paslaugų*, nevyriausybinio_sektoriaus

Norwegian	utfordring*, kris*, felles_beste, samhold*, nasjonalt_fellesskap, ansvar	frivil*, solidaritet, sivilsamfunnet, samfunn*, fellesskap*, organisasjoner
Polish	pożytku_publicznego, dobra_wspólnego, kryzys*, dobro_wspólne	organizacji_pozarządow*, społeczeństwa_obywatelskiego, inicjatyw_obywatelskich, organizacji_obywatelskich, ochotniczych_straży, działalności_pożytku, organizacji_społecznych
Portuguese	crise, unidade_nacional, solidariedade_nacional, coesão_social, coesão	assoc*, voluntari*, sociedade_civil, solidariedad*, particip*
Russian	русских_общин, российское_общество, российского_государства, кризис*, национальное_социальное_согласие	гражданского_общества, гражданское_общество, гражданская_инициатива*, инициативах_люди
Slovak	dobrej_vôle, spoločným_úsilím, spoločného_dobra, sociálna_súdržnosť, krízy	mimovládnych, občianskej_spoločnosti, občianska_spoločnosť, mimovládnych_organizácií, neziskové_organizácie, občiansku_spoločnosť, občiansky_aktivizmus, mimovládnym_organizáciám*
Spanish	movilización_social, cohesión_social, nacion_unida, interés_social, interés_común, interés_público, bien_común, crisis, responsabili*, cohesionad*, cohesión, unidad	voluntari*, iniciativa_social, participación, comunitat*, comunidad*, associacionism*, sociedad_civil
Swedish	kollektivt_ansvar, krise*, personligt_ansvar, sterke_samfunn, större_staten, bygge_samfunn, ansvar	solidaritet*, ideella_organisationer, aktivt_medborgarskap, sivilt_samfunn
Ukrainian	кризі, загального_добра, єднання, примирення, разом_відбудовувати_країну	громадянського_суспільства, людська_солідарність, соціальних_груп

OpenAI (GPT-4o-mini) Prompt

Table A6. Exact prompt used to classify statements through OpenAI

model = GPT-4o-mini
temperature = 0
Prompt

Dear ChatGPT, you are an expert assistant in political science. Your task is to classify sentences extracted from the electoral programs of political parties into two subcategories of the macro-category 'Social Harmony/Civic Mindedness'. The two subcategories are: 'Responsibility Rhetoric' and 'Bottom-up activism'. Classification criteria are as follows:

- Assign a text to 'Responsibility Rhetoric' if it primarily concerns appeals to national solidarity, societal unity, public spirit, denunciation of antisocial behavior, or support for the public interest.

- Assign a text to 'Bottom-up activism' if it primarily involves positive references to civil society, volunteering, or appeals to grassroots movements and the people as a unified actor.

Rule: Each text can only be assigned to one subcategory. If it seems to fit both, assign it to the category you consider most appropriate.

Response format: Respond exclusively with '1' (for 'Responsibility Rhetoric') or '0' (for 'Bottom-up activism').